



## President

Steven D. Benjamin Richmond, VA

## President-Elect

Jerry J. Cox Mount Vernon, KY

## First Vice President

Theodore Simon Philadelphia, PA

## Second Vice President

E. G. Morris Austin, TX

## Treasurer

John Wesley Hall Little Rock, AR

## Secretary

Barry J. Pollack Washington, DC

## Immediate Past President

Lisa Monet Wayne Denver, CO

## Parliamentarian

Vicki H. Young San Francisco, CA

## Directors

Chris Adams Charleston, SC

Brian H. Bieber Coral Gables, FL

Andrew S. Birrell Minneapolis, MN

Alexander Bunin Houston, TX

Ellen C. Brotman Philadelphia, PA

William H. Buckman Moorestown, NJ

Ramon De La Cabada Miami, FL

Jean-Jacques Cabou Phoenix, AZ

Jay Clark Cincinnati, OH

Josh A. Cohen San Francisco, CA

Anthony Cotton Waukesha, WI

Aric M. Cramer St. George, UT

Candace C. Crouse Cincinnati, OH

Paul DeWolfe Baltimore, MD

Drew Findling Atlanta, GA

Richard K. Gilbert Washington, DC

Nina J. Ginsberg Alexandria, VA

Elissa Heinrichs Newtown, PA

Michael Heiskell Fort Worth, TX

Bonnie Hoffman Leesburg, VA

Richard S. Jaffe Birmingham, AL

Ashish S. Joshi Ann Arbor, MI

Nellie L. King West Palm Beach, FL

Benjamin R. Labranche Baton Rouge, LA

Tracy Miner Boston, MA

Tyrone Monciffe Houston, TX

Norman R. Mueller Denver, CO

George H. Newman Philadelphia, PA

Timothy P. O'Toole Washington, DC

Maria H. Sandoval San Juan, PR

Melinda Sarafa New York, NY

David Smith Alexandria, VA

Jeffrey E. Thoma Fairfield, CA

Geneva Vanderhorst Washington, DC

Christopher A. Wellborn Rock Hill, SC

Steven M. Wells Anchorage, AK

Christie N. Williams Dallas, TX

William P. Wolf Chicago, IL

## Executive Director

Norman L. Reimer Washington, DC

February 15, 2013  
via e-mail

Peter G. McCabe, Secretary  
Standing Committee on Rules of Prac. and Proc.  
Judicial Conference of the United States  
Administrative Office of the U.S. Courts  
Thurgood Marshall Federal Judiciary Bldg.  
One Columbus Circle, N.E., suite 4-170  
Washington, DC 20002

**COMMENTS OF THE  
NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF CRIMINAL DEFENSE LAWYERS  
Concerning Proposed Amendments to the Federal Rules  
of Criminal Procedure  
Published for Comment in August 2012**

Dear Mr. McCabe:

The National Association of Criminal Defense Lawyers is pleased to submit our comments with respect to the proposed changes in the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure. NACDL's comments on the proposed amendments to the Evidence Rules are being submitted separately. Our organization has more than 10,000 members; in addition, NACDL's 94 state and local affiliates, in all 50 states, comprise a combined membership of over 30,000 private and public defenders. NACDL, which celebrated its 50th Anniversary in 2008, is the preeminent organization in the United States representing the views, rights and interests of the defense bar and its clients.

**CRIMINAL RULES 5(d) and 58(b) - VIENNA CONVENTION**

We generally supported the version of these identical amendments as originally proposed for comment in 2010, although we noted that the phrasing of the amendments "could be clearer." See 10-CR-001, Comments of National Association of Criminal Defense Lawyers. We commented that it was important that the Magistrate or District Judge's advice not misstate (and particularly, that it not understate) the rights of the detainee under the Vienna Convention. Regrettably, the revised proposal continues to use the unclear phrase, "if the defendant is held in custody." Our position remains the same as it was two years ago, including our suggestion that the language of the amendments be made more clear insofar as it attempts to summarize the

detainee's treaty rights, and with respect to whether the phrase "is held" refers to the defendant's status at the commencement of, or at the conclusion of, the hearing.

The National Association of Criminal Defense Lawyers is grateful for the opportunity to submit its views on these proposals. We look forward to continuing to work with the Committee in the years to come.

Very truly yours,  
*s/Peter Goldberger*

Alexander Bunin  
Houston, Texas  
Cheryl Stein  
Washington, D.C.

William J. Genego\*  
Santa Monica, CA  
Peter Goldberger\*  
Ardmore, PA

National Association of Criminal Defense Lawyers  
Committee on Rules of Procedure

*Please reply to:*  
Peter Goldberger, Esq.  
50 Rittenhouse Place  
Ardmore, PA 19003

\* Co-Chairs