

No. 22-4489

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE FOURTH COURT**

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,
Plaintiff/Appellee,

v.

OKELLO T. CHATRIE,
Defendant/Appellant.

**On Appeal From the United States District Court
for the Eastern District of Virginia
Richmond Division (The Hon. M. Hannah Lauck)**

JOINT APPENDIX

VOLUME 9 of 11 (pages 2091 - 2092)

JESSICA D. ABER
United States Attorney

Kenneth R. Simon, Jr., Ass't U.S. Attorney
Peter S. Duffey, Ass't U.S. Attorney
Counsel for Appellee
919 East Main Street, Suite 1900
Richmond, VA 23219
(804) 819-5400

Nathan P. Judish, Senior Counsel
Computer Crime & Intel. Property Section
Criminal Division
U.S. Department of Justice

GEREMY C. KAMENS
Federal Public Defender

Laura J. Koenig
Assistant Federal Public Defender
Counsel for Appellant
701 East Broad Street, Suite 3600
Richmond, VA 23219
(804) 565-0800

Michael W. Price, Litigation Dir.
NACDL Fourth Amendment Ctr.
1660 L Street NW, 12th Floor
Washington, DC 20036

This page intentionally left blank for double-sided pagination and printing

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME 1 (pages 1 - 176)

District Court Docket Sheet (as of Jan. 17, 2023)1

Indictment (Sept. 17, 2019, Doc. 1).....22

Defendant’s Motion to Suppress Evidence Obtained From a “Geofence”
General Warrant (Oct. 29, 2019, Doc. 29)25

Government’s Response in Opposition to Defendant’s Motion for
Suppression of Evidence Obtained Pursuant to Google Geofence
Warrant (Nov. 19, 2019, Doc. 41).....51

Defendant’s Reply to Government’s Response [to] Motion to Suppress
Evidence Obtained From a “Geofence” General Warrant (Dec. 9, 2019,
Doc. 48).....76

Exh. A (First Step 2 Request to Google) (Doc. 48-1)98

Exh. B (Second Step 2 Request to Google) (Doc. 48-2)100

Exh. C (Third Step 2 Request to Google) (Doc. 48-3).....102

Exh. D (Transcript, *Commonwealth v. Anderson*, No. CR17-4909-00F
(Va. Cir. Ct., Jan. 4, 2019)) (Doc. 48-4)..... omitted from J.A.

Government’s Notice Regarding Attachment of Google Geofence State
Search Warrant to Response in Opposition to Motion to Suppress (Dec.
18, 2019, Doc. 54)104

Affidavit for search warrant and warrant, with attachments (Doc. 54-1)107

Brief of Amicus Curiae Google LLC in Support of Neither Party
Concerning Defendant’s Motion to Suppress Evidence From a
“Geofence” General Warrant (Dec. 20, 2019, Doc. 59-1)118

United States’ Response to Amicus Curiae Brief of Google LLC (Jan. 10,
2020, Doc. 71).....148

Defendant’s Response to Google’s Motion to File Amicus Curiae Brief in
Support of Neither Party (Jan. 10, 2020, Doc. 72)158

VOLUME 2 (pages 177 - 416)

Transcript, Discovery Motion Hearing (Jan. 21, 2020, Doc. 81; <i>see</i> Doc. 77 (court minutes)).....	177
Preliminary matters.....	179
Def’t witness Spencer McInville	
Direct examination.....	193
Cross examination.....	283
Redirect examination.....	306
Argument by the defense.....	318
Argument by the government.....	332
Rebuttal by the defense.....	350
Court’s ruling.....	355
Defendant’s Supplemental Motion to Suppress Evidence Obtained From a “Geofence” General Warrant (May 22, 2020, Doc. 104).....	363
United States’ Response in Opposition to Defendant’s Motion for Suppression of Evidence Obtained Pursuant to Google Geofence Warrant (June 12, 2020, Doc. 109).....	393

VOLUME 3 (pages 417 - 694)

Transcript, Suppression Motion Hearing, Day 1 (evidence) (Mar. 4, 2021, Doc. 201; <i>see</i> Doc. 198 (court minutes)).....	417
Preliminary matters.....	420
Def’t witness Spencer McInville	
Direct examination.....	432
Cross examination.....	542
Redirect examination.....	586
Def’t witness Marlo McGriff	
Direct examination.....	606

VOLUME 4 (pages 695 - 1070)

Transcript, Suppression Motion Hearing, Day 2 (evidence) (Mar. 5, 2021, Doc. 202; <i>see</i> Doc. 199 (court minutes)).....	695
Preliminary matters.....	698
Def’t witness Marlo McGriff, cont’d	
Direct examination.....	699
Cross examination.....	791
Redirect examination.....	841
Def’t witness Sarah Rodriguez	
Direct examination.....	862
Cross examination.....	902
Redirect examination.....	916
Gov’t witness Jeremy D’Errico	
Direct examination.....	923
Cross examination.....	967
Redirect examination.....	1010
Gov’t witness Joshua Hylton	
Direct examination.....	1016
Cross examination.....	1040
Redirect examination.....	1063
Concluding matters.....	1064

VOLUME 5 (pages 1071 - 1326)

Defendant’s Post-Hearing Brief on “Geofence” General Warrant (May 3, 2021, Doc. 205).....	1071
Government’s Response in Opposition to Defendant’s Motion for Suppression (May 21, 2020, Doc. 214; <i>see</i> Doc. 207-2).....	1117
Defendant’s Reply to Government’s Response in Opposition to Motion for Suppression (June 4, 2020, Doc. 213).....	1164
Transcript, Suppression Hearing (arguments) (June 24, 2021, Doc. 217; <i>see</i> Doc. 215 (court minutes)).....	1185

Argument by the defense1187
Argument by the government1231
Rebuttal by the defense.....1313

Concluding matters1322

VOLUME 6 (pages 1327 - 1456)

Memorandum Opinion (denying suppression motion) (Mar. 3, 2022,
Doc. 220).....1327

Order (denying suppression motion) (Mar. 3, 2022, Doc. 221)1390

Criminal Information (May 6, 2022, Doc. 224)1391

Transcript, Change of Plea Hearing (May 9, 2022, Doc. 247; *see* Doc. 226)
.....1394

Plea Agreement (May 9, 2022, Doc. 228)1428

Statement of Facts (May 9, 2022, Doc. 229)1444

Judgment in a Criminal Case (Aug. 19, 2022, Doc. 239).....1449

Notice of Appeal (Aug. 25, 2022, Doc. 241).....1456

VOLUME 7 (pages 1457 - 1810) – DOCUMENT EXHIBITS

Exhibits Admitted at Discovery Motion Hearing (Jan. 21, 2020)

Def’t Exh. 1: Geofence Warrant & Application (same as Doc. 54-1,
minus ECF header) *see* J.A. 107
Def’t Exh. 2: Google Amicus Brief (Doc. 59-1) *see* J.A. 118
Def’t Exh. 3: PDF of Raw Data (sealed) *see* J.A. 2093
Def’t Exh. 4: Activation Video..... omitted from J.A., available on request
Def’t Exh. 5: Three Paths Video (sealed)..... *see* J.A. 2139
Def’t Exh. 6: First Step 2 Request to Google1457
Def’t Exh. 7: Second Step 2 Request to Google.....1459
Def’t Exh. 8: Third Step 2 Request to Google1461

Def't Exh. 9: Step 3 Request to Google1463

Exhibits Admitted at Suppression Motion Hearing (Mar. 4-5, 2021)

Def't Exh. 1: Geofence Warrant & Application (same as Doc. 54-1,
minus ECF header) *see* J.A. 107
 Def't Exh. 2: Google Amicus Brief (Doc. 59-1) *see* J.A. 118
 Def't Exh. 3: PDF of Raw Data (sealed) *see* J.A. 2093
 Def't Exh. 5: Three Paths Video (sealed) *see* J.A. 2139
 Def't Exh. 6: Spencer McInville Report 1464
 Def't Exh. 7: Spencer McInville Supplemental Report 1469
 Def't Exh. 8: CSV Google Data File (.csv file) *see* J.A. 2139
 Def't Exh. 9: Unique in Crowd Study 1475
 Def't Exh. 11: September 2018 Oracle Submission 1480
 Def't Exh. 18: Federal Search Warrant Application & Attachments 1502
 Def't Exh. 19: State Search Warrants & Attachments 1534
 Def't Exh. 21: McGriff Declaration 1 (Doc. 96-1) 1551
 Def't Exh. 23: McGriff Declaration 3 (Doc. 147) 1562
 Def't Exh. 24: Rodriguez Declaration (Doc. 96-2) 1579
 Def't Exh. 27: Every Step You Take 1587
 Def't Exh. 30: AZ Ex. 18 (admitted portions only) 1631
 Def't Exh. 31: AZ Ex. 19 (admitted portions only) 1633
 Def't Exh. 32: AZ Ex. 20 1639
 Def't Exh. 33: AZ Ex. 24 1644
 Def't Exh. 34: AZ Ex. 202 1667
 Def't Exh. 36: AZ Ex. 209 1777
 Def't Exh. 38: AZ Ex. 219 1781
 Def't Exh. 40: AZ Ex. 236 1797
 Def't Exh. 41: AZ Ex. 260 1804

VOLUME 8 (pages 1811 - 2090) – DOCUMENT EXHIBITS, CONT'D

Exhibits Admitted at Suppression Motion Hearing (Mar. 4-5, 2021), cont'd

Def't Exh. 43: May 2018 Privacy Policy – Redline 1811
 Def't Exh. 43a: May 2018 Privacy Policy – Redline (with internet
source information) 1840
 Def't Exh. 44: Jan. 2019 Privacy Policy – Redline 1865
 Def't Exh. 45: Oct. 2019 Privacy Policy – Redline 1895
 Def't Exh. 46: McGriff Blog 1 1926

Def’t Exh. 47: McGriff Blog 21929
 Def’t Exh. 48: 2018 Quartz Article1934
 Def’t Exh. 49: 2018 AP Article 11941
 Def’t Exh. 51: 2019 NYT Article1948
 Def’t Exh. 53: Blumenthal-Markey Letter to FTC.....1957

Gov’t Exh. 1: CAST PowerPoint Presentation.....1981
 Gov’t Exh. 2: Geofence Warrant (Doc. 54-1) *see* J.A. 107
 Gov’t Exh. 3: Declaration of Marlo McGriff (Mar. 11, 2020)
 (same as Def’t Exh. 21 (Doc. 96-1)) *see* J.A. 1551
 Gov’t Exh. 3a: Declaration of Sarah Rodriguez (Mar. 11, 2020)
 (same as Def’t Exh. 24 (Doc. 96-2)) *see* J.A. 1579
 Gov’t Exh. 3b: Supplemental Declaration of McGriff (June 17, 2020)
 (Doc. 110-1).....2032
 Gov’t Exh. 3c: Third Declaration of Marlo McGriff (Aug. 7, 2020)
 (same as Def’t Exh. 23 (Doc. 147))..... *see* J.A. 1562
 Gov’t Exh. 4: Joshua Hylton emails with Google2034
 Gov’t Exh. 5: Google Privacy Policy2048
 Gov’t Exh. 5a: Google Terms of Service2081
 Gov’t Exh. 6: Special Agent D’Errico’s C.V.2088
 Gov’t Exh. 12: “Got to Be Mobile” Video *see* J.A. 2091

VOLUME 9 (pages 2091 - 2092) – DIGITAL MEDIA EXHIBIT

Gov’t Exh. 12: “Got to Be Mobile” Video (admitted only at suppression
 motion hearing)..... (.mp4 file)

VOLUME 10 (pages 2093 - 2138) – SEALED DOCUMENT EXHIBIT

Def’t Exh. 3: PDF of Raw Data (*see* Doc. 69 (sealing order)) (admitted at
 both discovery motion hearing and suppression motion hearing).....2093

VOLUME 11 (pages 2139 - end) – SEALED DIGITAL MEDIA EXHIBITS

Def’t Exh. 5: Three Paths Video (admitted at both discovery motion hearing
 and suppression motion hearing) (.mp4 file)
 Def’t Exh. 8: CSV Google Data File (admitted only at suppression motion
 hearing) (.csv file, viewable in Excel)

Gov't Exh. 12 ("Got to Be Mobile" Video)
(file name: 22-4489 Chatrle Govt Exh 12.mp4)

This file has been scanned for viruses and found to be virus-free.

This page intentionally left blank for double-sided pagination and printing