# Supervision for People with Disabilities

February 6, 2025

Presented by West Resendes and Brian Dimmick, ACLU Disability Rights Program; Allison Frankel, ACLU Criminal Law Reform Project

## Background: Supervision and Disability

#### **Criminal Supervision Overview**

**3.7** million people, or 1 in every 71 **Must follow 10-20 rules per day Q**Rules are complex & conflicting Lasts for years, decades, or life **Risk of incarceration for any** violation





Background: Supervision and Disability

#### **Overrepresentation of Disability**

#### **Higher rates of:**

- Mental health conditions
- Substance Use Disorder
- Intellectual/developmental disabilities
- Chronic illnesses
- > Hearing and vision disabilities



#### **Barriers to Understanding Conditions**

- <u>Effectively communicating</u> about conditions given vision and hearing disabilities
- <u>Comprehending</u> conditions with cognitive disabilities
- Remembering and keeping track of conditions due to memory difficulties





#### **Barriers to Effective Engagement**

- <u>Effectively communicating during</u> meetings for people who are deaf/hard of hearing
- <u>Trusting and engaging</u> with supervision authorities given mental health conditions
- <u>Stigma</u> against certain disabilityrelated behaviors (e.g., fidgeting, difficulty focusing, speaking loudly)





#### **Barriers Getting to Required Appointments**

- Inaccessible meeting locations
- Transportation barriers
- Triggering due to site of prior trauma
- Difficulty leaving home given anxiety, depression, or paranoia
- Trouble remembering or planning for meetings given cognitive disabilities





#### **Barriers to Engaging in Mandated Treatment**

- Navigating logistics to enroll in treatment
- Programs inappropriate to disabilityrelated needs
- Prohibitions on Medication-Assisted Treatment (MAT)
  - Violates ADA if the individual has Opioid Use Disorder





#### **Additional Obstacles**

•Structural Barriers: Housing, job, healthcare access

•Unequal Treatment: Closer surveillance, more conditions, heightened chance of incarceration

•Lack of Accommodations Systems: Few supervision agencies have systems to proactively assess/provide accommodations



#### **Real-World Examples**

12. My CSO knows about my congestive heart failure. I also gave my CSO a list of all of my appointments at the VA hospital and asked that my supervision meetings account for them. She never offered to change my appointment dates, and she has never offered to meet me at my home rather than require me to come into her office. She has also never offered to let me call-in instead of report in-person.

45. The Commission knew that I was getting help from ULS for my mental health. The

Commission also knew that I was making lots of efforts, despite my mental health issues, to

follow my supervision rules. It felt like none of that mattered to the Parole Commission.



#### **Real-World Examples Cont'd**







#### **Americans with Disabilities Act**

Covers the activities of state and local government entities

Includes court systems

Also includes supervision agencies

Federal supervision—not directly covered by the ADA



#### **Americans with Disabilities Act**

"[N]o qualified individual with a disability shall, by reason of such disability, be excluded from participation in or be denied the benefits of the services, programs, or activities of a public entity, or be subjected to discrimination by any such entity."

#### 42 U.S.C. § 12132



#### What is a Disability?

Physical or mental impairment that substantially limits one or more major life activities

Broad coverage

- Not a demanding standard
- Not just physical/mobility disabilities

Includes mental health conditions and hidden

disabilities



#### **Substance Use Disorder**

- The ADA does not cover people engaged in the current illegal use of drugs
- But it does cover:
  - Those in recovery not currently using
  - Those dependent on alcohol
  - Those with a record of addiction and treatment



#### **Discrimination Under the ADA**

- **Available Legal Theories**
- •Unequal Treatment
- Lack of equal opportunity
- Integration mandate
- Failure to make reasonable modifications
- Failure to provide effective communication



#### **Reasonable Accommodations**

- <u>Reasonable Accommodations</u>: Changes to the rules or how things are done that allow a person with a disability an equal opportunity to succeed
  - May involve removing or altering otherwise-required conditions
  - Inherently individualized
  - Interactive process



#### **Reasonable Accommodations Cont'd**

- Agencies must *proactively* assess accommodation needs
- But best practice to request needed accommodations
  - No "magic words"
  - Ask about system to request accommodations & ADA coordinator
- Sometimes need documentation



#### **Reasonable Accommodations: Defenses**





 Response:
Govt needs specific, individualized evidence of burden/threat



Effective Communication – Auxiliary Aids & Services for Hearing Disabilities

- Qualified sign language interpreters
- Real-time captioning
- Assistive listening devices
- Captioned phones
- Video Relay Services





#### Effective Communication – Auxiliary Aids & Services for Vision Disabilities

- Braille materials
- Large Print materials
- Audio recordings
- Screen readers
- Magnification software





#### Effective Communication – Preferred Method of Communication (PMC)

- Way that the disabled person prefers to receive information and communicate with others, considering their individual needs and circumstances
- Primary Consideration
- Obligation to provide an alternative aid or service if not using PMC
- Increased likelihood of understanding with PMC



#### **Effective Communication – Plain Language**

- Barrier to Understanding
- Clear, concise, well-organized
- Typically relies on:

Reader-Centered Organization	Active, not passive, voice	Short sentences and paragraphs
"You" and other pronouns	Common, everyday words	Simple design features (e.g., tables!)



#### **Effective Communication – A Real-World Application**

Deaf Interpreters





Supervision Litigation: Cobb v. Georgia Department of Community Supervision

#### Lawsuit

- Filed in Northern District of Georgia in 2019
- Alleged that Georgia Department of Community Supervision was:
  - Denying equal access to the benefits of supervision
  - Failing to provide effective communication



#### Lawsuit

- District court certified a class and denied summary judgment
  - 2022 WL 22865202 (N.D. Ga. Oct. 13, 2022)



#### **The Settlement**

- 1. Communication Assessment
- 2. Communication Plan
- 3. Appropriate use of auxiliary aids

#### NOTICE TO THE CLASS: COBB V. GEORGIA DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY SUPERVISION **Settlement Agreement**

This is the ASL translation and plain language version of Cobb v Georgia Department of Community Supervision Settlement Agreement.

Definitions (Part II) Recitals Terms and Conditions (Part I) Terms and Conditions (Part II) Definitions (Part I)

Communication Assessment and Plan





#### Cobb v. GDCS Case Study

DCS

## Supervision Litigation: Mathis v. United States Parole Commission

#### Mathis v. USPC

- Systemic failure to accommodate people on parole/supervised release in Washington, D.C.
- Covers all types of disabilities
- Court rejected Motion to Dismiss & granted Preliminary Injunction requiring accommodations for named Plaintiffs
- Awaiting class-cert decision

Case 1:24-cv-01312-TNM Docume	
UNITED STATES D FOR THE DISTRIC	
WILLIAM MATHIS and KENNEDY DAVIS, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,	
Plaintiffs,	
v.	Case No. 1:24-cv-01312 (TNM)
UNITED STATES PAROLE COMMISSION, et al.,	
Defendants.	
ORD	ER
Upon consideration of Plaintiffs' Motion f	for Preliminary Injunction (ECF No. 3).

Defendants' Motion to Dismiss (ECF No. 25), the pleadings, relevant law, related legal memoranda and arguments of counsel in support and opposition, and the entire record of this case, for the reasons set forth in the accompanying Memorandum Opinion, it is hereby ORDERED that Plaintiffs' [3] Motion for Preliminary Injunction is GRANTED. It is further

ORDERED that Defendants United States Parole Commission, Patricia Cushwa (in her official capacity as Acting Chairman of the Commission), Court Services and Offender Supervision Agency, and Richard Tischner (in his official capacity as Director of CSOSA) assess what reasonable accommodations named Plaintiffs William Mathis and Kennedy Davis require to have an equal opportunity to succeed on supervision based on their individual disabilityrelated needs, and provide any and all such required accommodations. It is further



#### Mathis v. USPC Key Takeaways

- Discrimination is "by reason of" disability if disability makes it harder to navigate supervision without needed accommodations
  - Even if other factors (e.g., housing instability) contribute to downstream harms such as revocation





#### Mathis v. USPC Key Takeaways Cont'd

- Denial of equal treatment is itself an "injury"
  - Even if Plaintiffs ultimately complete supervision without any alleged violations
  - "The law requires no further downstream harms"





#### **Identifying Reasonable Accommodations**

- Initiate the discussion with your client
- Don't make assumptions about disabilities
- Ask open-ended questions
  - Are there any communication methods that work best for you?
  - Do you have any difficulty with reading, writing, or understanding information?
  - Are there any parts of the supervision process that you think might be challenging?



#### **Universal Design in your Practice**

- Provide flexible scheduling for appointments
- Provide materials in plain language
- Use teach-back technique rather than asking "do you understand?"
- Provide take-home notes





#### **Seeking Accommodations**

#### When to Raise

- When conditions are set
- During course of supervision
- During revocation

#### **How to Raise**

- Court filings
- Informal advocacy with supervision authorities
- Demand letter

#### Caveat: case-specific strategic concerns



#### **Potential Reasonable Accommodations**

- Moving meetings or making them virtual
- Rescheduling appointments
- Meeting reminders
- Plain language
- Consistent schedules and supervision officers
- Interpreters or other communication aids



#### **Opportunities for Collaboration**

- Thought partnership on individual cases
- Resource sharing
- Investigate systemic violations





### **Questions and Answers**

#### Resources

- Reducing Barriers Report: <u>https://www.aclu.org/publications/reducing-barriers-a-guide-to-obtaining-reasonable-accommodations-for-people-with-disabilities-on-supervision</u>
- Cobb Settlement: <u>https://www.aclu.org/documents/settlement-agreement-cobb-v-georgia-department-of-community-supervision</u>
- Cobb ADA Policy: <u>https://www.aclu.org/documents/americans-with-</u> <u>disabilities-act-policy-cobb-v-georgia-department-of-community-supervision</u>
- Mathis Preliminary Injunction: <u>https://www.aclu.org/cases/mathis-v-united-states-parole-commission?document=Preliminary-Injunction-Opinion</u>





Photo Copyright Flickr-Via Tsuji

#### **For More Information**

West Resendes, ACLU Disability Rights Program: <u>wresendes@aclu.org</u>

Brian Dimmick, ACLU Disability Rights Program: <u>bdimmick@aclu.org</u>

Allison Frankel, ACLU Criminal Law Reform Project: <u>afrankel@aclu.org</u>



